In science the credit goes to the man who convinces the world, not the man to whom the idea first occurs.
Sir Francis Darwin (1848 - 1925)
Good Earth®

Wisdom from tea dipper handle
Before sending it off for review

- Be generous in attributing the work of others
  - The reviewer is likely someone who
    - you cited
    - should have cited
    - their friends
    - someone who cares about history

- Polish helps

- KISS (Keep it Simple Stupid)
  - Lead the reader where you want them to go
Dealing with the review

• The reviewer is (almost) always right!
  – If they are wrong, likely you were not clear enough to the right audience

• You must learn from what they say
  – Only you have something to gain

• Old saying to keep in mind
  – Wise men learn more from fools than fools from the wise. -- Cato the Elder

• And most important
  – Get a thick skin!
Reviewing generalities

• Be polite.
  – Don’t write what you would regret if the author found out who you were!

• Begin with a short paragraph demonstrating that you read the paper
• Often this is followed by strengths and weaknesses
• This is often followed by substantive comments to support your decision
• This is then followed by minor comments / suggestions
• Conference reviewing often have forms that guide you through the above

• Be skeptical
  – A good writer will lead you down a path (so be a skeptic).
  – Check for prior work (Google makes this easy)
  – For experiments, ask yourself what does this really show.
  – Who cares anyway?
    • Will this have any impact (intellectual or broad)
Editorial Suggestions
(for reviewing your colleague’s work)

• What to look for in the prose
  – plagiarism?
  – order!
  – source?
  – vague or too abstract (very common error)
  – waffle
  – unclear
  – boring / content free
  – off topic
    • is the section on X about X?
    • is the paragraph supporting the argument it is starting with
  – // (new para)
English is hard!

Text I corrected in a paper I just reviewed. Can you explain denote vs denotes here?

Let X denote A. Y denotes B.